

The Comparison of Methods Used in Translating *Die with A Smile* Song between Google Translate and YouTube Closed Caption

Adrian Putra Viera¹ and *Nurul Huda Gus Tema²

¹Universitas Terbuka, INDONESIA

²Universitas Lambung Mangkurat, INDONESIA

*nurulhudagt@gmail.com

Article Information

Received:

22 April 2025

Revised:

16 May 2025

Accepted:

21 May 2025

Abstract

This study discusses the comparison of the techniques and methods used in translating the song *Die With A Smile* between Google Translate and YouTube Closed Captions. In addition, the problem focused on examining the acceptability of the translation results. Hence, the theories of translation methods and techniques as an analytical framework were used to evaluate the quality of translations from both platforms, while a qualitative method was implemented. The results show that YouTube Closed Captions produces better translations than Google Translate. This is due to the application of more contextual translation techniques and methods that tend to approach communicative translation. In contrast, Google Translate tends to use a literal approach that ignores the nuances of the target language, resulting in low acceptability and clarity of the message. These findings highlight the importance of using appropriate methods and techniques to produce more effective and natural translations, especially in the context of song translation.

Keywords: *translation, technique, method, Google Translate, Youtube, closed captions.*

Cite this paper:

Viera, Adrian P., & Tema, Nurul H.G. (2025). The Comparison of Methods Used in Translating Die with A Smile Song between Google Translate and YouTube Closed Caption. *JOINT: Journal of Inspirational English Language Teaching*, 2(1), 69-77. <https://doi.org/10.33830/joint.v1i2.11845>

INTRODUCTION

Translation is defined as an activity of interpreting and changing meaning from a source language (SL) to another language or target language (TL). Since an interpreter converts any spoken material from one language (the source language) into a different language (the target language), on the other hand, a translator converts any written material (Davis, 2020). Meanwhile, other previous scholars revealed that in the field of literature, translation explains the process of translating from one language to another while maintaining meaning and style (Yang, 2010). Nida and Taber (1989) state that translation includes the arrangement of natural equivalents (words, phrases, and sentences) that are close to the SL and the TL, by prioritizing meaning over style. Translation can be conducted on



fictional texts, literary works, and even songs. A song can be considered to be more difficult to translate, since there is an intended message contained and some idioms and aesthetical poetries as well (Khoshsaligheh et al., 2023).

However, in this era, we cannot deny that the development of technology is no longer a tool that assists the community in finding information and changing communication patterns in daily life (Aminullah & Ali, 2020), while it can be turned into some translator machines. One of the most outstanding translation machines is Google Translate, while in the YouTube itself, there is an automatic translation tool known as Closed Caption (CC). Several studies that have been carried out previously have examined the accuracy of translation on YouTube, such as (Kardijan, 2019), (Agy & Anggraeni, 2020), (Diana & Natalia, 2022), and (Rahmawati & Malik, 2023).

In the study conducted by Agy & Anggraeni (2020), the translation was dominated by a single technique that focuses on literal techniques. The percentage of data shows the accuracy, with the total number of accurate = 70%, less accurate = 17.5%, and inaccurate translation = 12.5%. Meanwhile, there is also a study that examines translation on a blogspot, as conducted by Kardijan (2019), whereas the researcher examines Bon Jovi's song entitled *It's My life*. The results of the study showed that there were six translation techniques used in translating the song *It's My Life*, namely compensation 36.9%, adaptation 10.5%, generalization 15.8%, modulation 10.5%, particularization 15.8%, and reduction 10.5%.

In the research conducted by Kardijan (2019), the composition of accuracy, acceptability and readability for each technique used was also obtained: (1) Compensation in terms of accuracy (94.7% accurate, 5.3% less accurate), acceptability (89.5% acceptable, 10.5% less acceptable), readability (100% easy to understand); (2) Adaptation in terms of accuracy (89.6% accurate, 10.4% less accurate), acceptability (100% acceptable), readability (100% easy to understand); (3) Generalization in terms of accuracy (33.4% accurate, 66.6% less accurate), acceptability (100% acceptable), readability (100% easy to understand), (4) Modulation in terms of accuracy (96.4% accurate, 3.6% less accurate), acceptability (92.6 acceptable, 7.4% less acceptable), readability (89.5% easy to understand, 10.5% less understandable), (5) Particularization in terms of accuracy (89.8% accurate, 10.2% less accurate), acceptability (66.4% acceptable, 3.6% less acceptable), readability (93.7% easy to understand, 6.3% less understandable), (6) Reduction in terms of accuracy (97.3% accurate, 2.7% less accurate), acceptability (98.4% acceptable, 1.6% less acceptable), readability (93.7% easy to understand, 6.3% less understandable). On the other hand, the translation found in the YouTube CC tend to prioritize the TL.

Another previous study conducted by Putera (2024) had revealed that CC can effectively translate the SL since it translated by using more linguistics amplification that make an adaptation to the TL as well, but this feature has limitations in translating terminology connected to culture, names, and local vocabulary, resulting in a lack of equivalence in the TL that convey the same meaning as the original, that might be similar to Google Translate, while we have to make a research to analyze the difference, and even though the translations were carried out by machines, there are some indicators that are used to analyze the translation results (Molina and Albir, 2002), to find the more data on the use of some techniques in translating



song lyrics, which include literal translation techniques, discursive creation, adaptation, linguistic amplification, modulation, transposition, and conventional equivalence, as well as double translation techniques, while like other previous studies, they tend to prioritize more on the TL, while in this study, the researchers want to compare a new translation carried out by YouTube CC and Google Translate that usually has a more literal version of translation.

Therefore, this study aimed to conduct a different study on song lyrics translation, by comparing the results of the translation obtained from translation machines automatically carried out in two different applications. For the novelty of this study, the author examined the method of translating songs from English to Indonesian, between Google Translate and YouTube CC, and compared them. In addition, the units of language were in the clauses form contained in a song. In a song, when translating the lyrics, listeners of the song can interpret the lyrics according to the listeners' imagination (Aronson & Box, 2021). However, there are still some standards and the interpreted meanings are not much different (Aronson & Box, 2021). In addition, a song contains several idioms as well. Chaer (2014:46) stated that an idiom is a construction whose meaning is not the same as the combined meaning of its members. According to Subroto in (Gusti, 2021), an idiom is defined as a combination of several words that are a fixed arrangement or expression. Meanwhile, an idiom can have biased meanings since it cannot be understood or understood word for word. In addition, Newmark (1988:47) stated, "*Idiomatic translation reproduces the 'message' of the original but tends to distort the nuances of meaning by preferring colloquialisms and idioms where these do not exist in the original*".

METHOD

The research was conducted using a qualitative method, as a method that uses more data in the form of words than data that uses numbers (Mayring, 2014). This method involves an in-depth understanding of the source text and translation by identifying differences in the delivery of information, meaning, and deviations. According to Bogdan et al. (2019:27), qualitative research is descriptive data collected in the form of words or images and obtained the data in the form of conversation fragments, not numbers. Hence, the researchers prioritized the analysis of words contained in every lyric as the data source was the lyric of the song *Die with A Smile* by Lady Gaga featuring Bruno Mars. Hence, in this study, there were two types of lyric translations, namely lyrics translated via Google Translate and lyrics generated from YouTube Closed Captions (CC), in the official music video of *Die with A Smile*. Humans instrument were used to analyze the data, since it relies on the knowledge that the researchers obtained (Mayring, 2014). In addition, the data collection procedures were by reading and understanding the meaning of the lyrics of the song *Die With A Smile*, then comparing the translation results from Google Translate with YouTube CC.

Die with A Smile was a song written by American singer Lady Gaga featuring Bruno Mars. The song was released on August 16, 2024, under Interscope Records (Wikipedia). This collaboration was the result of Mars inviting Gaga to his studio where he was working on new music. She presented the song in progress to him and the two finished writing and recording



the song on the same day. In the song, Lady Gaga and Bruno Mars express a strong longing to be with a loved one. The song is in the Soft Rock genre and is 4 minutes 11 seconds long.

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

By using the indicators of translation techniques by Molina and Albir (2002), and comparing with other previous studies, such as Kardijan (2019), Agy & Anggraeni (2020), Rahmawati & Malik (2023), Diana & Natalia (2022), and Putera (2024) which identified the lyrics translation done by a machine, and how to translate idiomatic and aesthetic clauses, there are some findings elaborated as follows:

“Ooh
*I, I just woke up from a dream
Where you and I had to say goodbye
And I don't know what it all means
But since I survived, I realized
Wherever you go, that's where I'll follow
Nobody's promised tomorrow
So I'ma love you every night like it's the last night
Like it's the last night
If the world was ending, I'd wanna be next to you
If the party was over and our time on Earth was through
I'd wanna hold you just for a while and die with a smile
If the world was ending, I'd wanna be next to you
Ooh
Oh, lost, lost in the words that we scream
I don't even wanna do this anymore
'Cause you already know what you mean to me
And our love's the only war worth fighting for
Wherever you go, that's where I'll follow
Nobody's promised tomorrow
So I'ma love you every night like it's the last night
Like it's the last night
If the world was ending, I'd wanna be next to you
If the party was over and our time on Earth was through
I'd wanna hold you just for a while and die with a smile
If the world was ending, I'd wanna be next to you
Right next to you
Next to you
Right next to you
Oh-oh, oh
If the world was ending, I'd wanna be next to you
If the party was over and our time on Earth was through
I'd wanna hold you just for a while and die with a smile
If the world was ending, I'd wanna be next to you
If the world was ending, I'd wanna be next to you
Ooh
I'd wanna be next to you*



There is a comparison table of the translation results produced by Google Translate and YouTube Closed Captions (CC), from English to Bahasa Indonesia, while there are some abbreviations used for Source Language (SL) and Target Language (TL).

Table 1. The Comparison Results

Google Translate	YouTube Closed Captions
<p>Ooh</p> <p>Aku, aku baru saja terbangun dari mimpi Dimana kamu dan aku harus mengucapkan selamat tinggal</p> <p>Dan aku tidak tahu apa arti semua itu Tapi sejak saya selamat, saya sadar Ke mana pun kamu pergi, ke sanalah aku akan mengikuti</p> <p>Tidak ada yang menjanjikan hari esok Jadi aku mencintaimu setiap malam seperti malam terakhir</p> <p>Sepertinya ini malam terakhir Jika dunia ini berakhir, aku ingin berada di sampingmu</p> <p>Jika pesta telah usai dan waktu kita di Bumi telah selesai</p> <p>Aku ingin memelukmu sebentar dan mati dengan senyuman</p> <p>Jika dunia ini berakhir, aku ingin berada di sampingmu</p> <p>Ooh</p> <p>Oh, tersesat, tersesat dalam kata-kata yang kita teriakkan</p> <p>Aku bahkan tidak ingin melakukan ini lagi Karena kamu sudah tahu apa maksudmu bagiku</p> <p>Dan cinta kita adalah satu-satunya perang yang patut diperjuangkan</p> <p>Ke mana pun kamu pergi, ke sanalah aku akan mengikuti</p> <p>Tidak ada yang menjanjikan hari esok Jadi aku mencintaimu setiap malam seperti malam terakhir</p> <p>Sepertinya ini malam terakhir Jika dunia ini berakhir, aku ingin berada di sampingmu</p> <p>Jika pesta telah usai dan waktu kita di Bumi telah selesai</p> <p>Aku ingin memelukmu sebentar dan mati dengan senyuman</p>	<p>Aku</p> <p>Aku, Aku baru saja terbangun dari mimpi Saat kau dan aku harus bilang selamat tinggal Dan aku tak tahu maksudnya</p> <p>Tetapi karena aku bertahan, kusadari Ke mana pun kau pergi, aku akan mengikutimu</p> <p>Esok tak pasti</p> <p>Jadi aku akan mencintaimu tiap malam seakan ini malam terakhir</p> <p>Seakan ini malam terakhir</p> <p>Jika dunia ini berakhir, aku ingin ada di sampingmu</p> <p>Jika pesta telah usai, dan waktu kita di dunia berakhir</p> <p>Aku ingin memelukmu sebentar saja dan mati dalam kebahagiaan</p> <p>Jika dunia berakhir, aku ingin ada di sampingmu</p> <p>Ooh, ooh</p> <p>Ooh, tenggelam, tenggelam dalam kata-kata yang kita teriakkan</p> <p>Aku bahkan tak mau melakukan ini lagi Karena kau sudah tahu arti dirimu bagiku</p> <p>Dan cinta kita satu-satunya yang layak kita perjuangkan</p> <p>Ke mana pun kau pergi, aku akan mengikutimu</p> <p>Esok tak pasti</p> <p>Jadi aku akan mencintaimu tiap malam seakan ini malam terakhir</p> <p>Seakan ini malam terakhir</p> <p>Jika dunia ini berakhir, aku ingin ada di sampingmu</p> <p>Jika pesta telah usai, dan waktu kita di dunia berakhir</p> <p>Aku ingin memelukmu sebentar saja dan mati dalam kebahagiaan</p> <p>Jika dunia berakhir, aku ingin ada di sampingmu</p> <p>Di sampingmu</p>



Jika dunia ini berakhir, aku ingin berada di sampingmu Tepat di sebelahmu Di sebelahmu Tepat di sebelahmu Oh-oh, oh Jika dunia ini berakhir, aku ingin berada di sampingmu Jika pesta telah usai dan waktu kita di Bumi telah selesai Aku ingin memelukmu sebentar dan mati dengan senyuman Jika dunia ini berakhir, aku ingin berada di sampingmu Jika dunia ini berakhir, aku ingin berada di sampingmu Ooh Aku ingin berada di sampingmu	Di sampingmu Di sampingmu Oh, oh, oh Jika dunia ini berakhir, aku ingin ada di sampingmu Jika pesta telah usai, dan waktu kita di dunia berakhir Aku ingin memelukmu sebentar saja dan mati dalam kebahagiaan Jika dunia berakhir, aku ingin ada di sampingmu Jika dunia berakhir, aku ingin ada di sampingmu Ooh Aku ingin ada di sampingmu
--	---

Translation Methods Used in Google Translate and Youtube Closed Caption

Table 2. Data 1

Lyric	Google Translate	YouTube Closed Captions
<i>Where you and I had to say goodbye</i>	Di mana kamu dan aku harus mengucapkan selamat tinggal	Saat kau dan aku harus bilang selamat tinggal

Based on Table 2, Google Translate uses literal translation method, where the translator translates sentences or phrases word for word. The equivalent words used are also common equivalent words commonly used in the Target Language (TL). Meanwhile, YouTube Closed Captions (CC) uses the adaptation method, while *kau* is a form of *you* that in Bahasa Indonesia, *you* can be translated as *kamu*, *kau*, *Anda*, *lo*, and other forms, based on the context. In the context of aesthetics, *kau* is more suitable. In addition, instead of preserving the word *where* into *di mana*, it is translated into *saat*.

Table 3. Data 2

Lyric	Google Translate	YouTube Closed Captions
<i>Nobody's promised tomorrow</i>	Tidak ada yang menjanjikan hari esok	Esok tak pasti

Based on Table 3, Google Translate uses the literal translation method. No equivalent words are added or subtracted, since the focus is on the words from the Source Language (SL). Meanwhile, the translation result of YouTube CC uses adaptation method. This method



changes the grammatical structure so that the meaning conveyed is the same as that felt by the reader and the message is conveyed to the reader and focuses on the clarity and acceptability of the TL.

Table 4. Data 3

Lyric	Google Translate	YouTube Closed Captions
<i>I'd wanna hold you just for a while and die with a smile</i>	Aku ingin memelukmu sebentar dan mati dengan senyuman	Aku ingin memelukmu sebentar saja dan mati dalam kebahagiaan

Based on the translation results of the data obtained previously, there are some literal translation methods that focus on the SL found in *Google Translate*. The translation results are accurate, but in terms of acceptability, it is still lacking because it seems stiff. Meanwhile, the translation result of YouTube CC are uses the linguistics amplification to emphasize the idiomatic atmosphere, since *Die with a smile* are not translated literally into “*die with a smile*”, but translated into “*mati dalam kebahagiaan*”, in order to add a poetic element to the song as well. This also increases the accuracy and acceptability of the translation of the phrase.

Table 5. Data 4

Lyric	Google Translate	YouTube Closed Captions
<i>Like it's the last night</i>	Seperti ini malam terakhir	Seakan ini malam terakhir

The translation from the Youtube CC is based on the context and will not make any ambiguity, while in the Google Translate version, the audiences will not know the context if they do not read the whole translation in the TL.

Table 6. Data 5

Lyric	Google Translate	YouTube Closed Captions
<i>If the party was over and our time on Earth was through</i>	Jika pesta telah usai dan waktu kita di Bumi telah berakhir	Jika pesta telah usai dan waktu kita di dunia berakhir

In line with Putera (2024), even though Youtube CC prioritizes the TL, but it has limitation on specific term, such as cultural terms and ecological terms. Based on data 5, instead of translating *earth* into the literal meaning *bumi*, the Youtube CC translated based on the context and the sense of the song, into *dunia*.

Meanwhile, in the lyrics, the readability of translation produced by Google Translate looks stiffer and less acceptable, since some words are translated word by word. The translation of some words is less appropriate since the lyrics of the song should be able to add to the aesthetics of the lyrics which should emphasize the feelings of the listener. However, the translation results produced by YouTube CC can be listened more naturally since they do not use literal translation but also use idiomatic translation and add more linguistics amplification.



It is a line with the finding by Putera (2024) For example, in the lyrics “*I wanna hold you just for a while, and die with a smile*”, Google Translate translates it into “*Aku ingin jatuh khawatir dan mati dengan senyuman*”, while YouTube CC translates it into “*Aku ingin jatuh khawatir saja dan mati dalam kebahagiaan*”. YouTube CC do not translate the word “*smile*” as “*senyuman*” but replace it with “*kebahagiaan*”. Translating idiomatic expressions can be challenging due to their figurative meanings, which often do not correspond directly to the literal meanings of the words involved. In line with Aronson & Box (2021), In translating the lyrics, listeners of the song *Die With A Smile* can interpret the lyrics according to the listeners' imagination. However, there are still clear standards and the interpreted meanings are not much different.

CONCLUSION

Based on the analysis results, in line with other previous studies, YouTube Closed Captions (CC) has differences in the methods of translation, since it tends to prioritize the Target Language (TL), but still has limitations with several specific terms. However, it is because Youtube CC aimed to translate based on the context, and the listeners can sing and feel the deep meaning, since it is translated based on the TL style as well. The results obtained also differ in terms of accuracy and acceptability. The translation carried out by Google Translate is accurate, but the level of acceptability is still lacking, especially in the context of translating songs. YouTube CC makes a translation that is more acceptable to the readers, and is better at conveying meaning from the SL to the TL.

REFERENCES

Agy, S., & Anggraeni, A. (2020). Analisis Teknik dan Metode Penerjemahan Lirik Lagu Bahasa Indonesia ke dalam Bahasa Mandarin pada Channel Youtube. *Longda Xiaokan: Journal of Mandarin Learning and Teaching*, 2(2), 48–57. <https://doi.org/10.15294/longdaxiaokan.v2i2.25861>

Aminullah, M., & Ali, M. (2020). Konsep Pengembangan Diri Dalam Menghadapi Perkembangan Teknologi Komunikasi Era 4.0. *Komunike*, 12(1), 1–23. <https://doi.org/10.20414/jurkom.v12i1.2243>

Aronson, G., & Box, K. (2021). Song Translation Analysis as a Means for Intercultural Connectivity. *Journal of Urban Society's Arts*, 8(1), 1–14. <https://doi.org/10.24821/jousa.v8i1.5444>

Bell, R. T. (1989). *Language Tests at School Translation and Translating: Theory and Practice*. https://www.academia.edu/download/58524148/Translation_and_Translating-Theory_and_Practice.pdf

Bogdan, Robert, Steven, J. Taylor, M. L. D. (2019). Introduction to Qualitative Research Method. In *Sustainability (Switzerland)* (Vol. 11, Issue 1). http://scioteca.caf.com/bitstream/handle/123456789/1091/RED2017-Eng-8ene.pdf?sequence=12&isAllowed=y%0Ahttp://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.regsciurbeco.2008.06.005%0Ahttps://www.researchgate.net/publication/305320484_SISTEM PEMBETUNGAN TERPUSAT STRATEGI MELESTARI

Davis, W. L. (2020). A Theory of Translation. *Visions in a Seer Stone*, 160–192. <https://doi.org/10.5149/northcarolina/9781469655666.003.0008>

Diana, R., & Natalia, A. (2022). Penggunaan Metode dan Teknik Penerjemahan Pada Lirik Lagu “Mungkin Nanti” Karya Ariel NOAH ke dalam Bahasa Jepang Oleh Hiroaki Kato. *Kiryoku*, 6(2), 85–94. <https://doi.org/10.14710/kiryoku.v6i2.85-94>

Gusti, I. (2021). Bentuk Idiom Dalam Majalah Pers Mahasiswa Di Universitas Sebelas Maret Surakarta. *Nuansa Indonesia*, 23(1), 13–24. <https://jurnal.uns.ac.id/ni>



Kardijan, D. (2019). Analisis Penerjemahan Lirik Lagu ‘It’s My Life’ Karya Bon Jovi Versi Tautan <http://Gudang-Terjemahan-Lagu.blogspot.co.id>. *Jurnal Siliwangi : Seri Pendidikan*, 5(1), 28–34. <http://jurnal.unsil.ac.id/index.php/jspendidikan/article/view/742>

Khoshsaligheh, M., Sarvghadi, F., & Che Lah, S. (2023). Song translation: Lyrics in context. *The International Journal of Translation and Interpreting Research*, 15(2), 176–179. <https://doi.org/10.12807/ti.115202.2023.r01>

Mayring. (2014). Qualitative Content Analysis. *The SAGE Handbook of Qualitative Data Analysis*, 170–183. <https://doi.org/10.4135/9781446282243.n12>

Newmark, P. (2001). *Approaches to Translation - Peter Newmark.pdf*.

Putera, L. J. (2024). *Information Correspondence on Automatic Translation (Closed Caption) of Speeches on The White House Youtube Channel*. 2019.

Rahmawati, K., & Malik, A. (2023). Analisis Komparasi Kajian Terjemahan Inggris-Arab Dan Inggris-Indonesia Pada Lirik Lagu Bts. *Adabiyyāt: Jurnal Bahasa Dan Sastra*, 7(2), 133. <https://doi.org/10.14421/ajbs.2023.07021>

Vinet, L., & Zhedanov, A. (2011). A “missing” family of classical orthogonal polynomials. *Journal of Physics A: Mathematical and Theoretical*, 44(8), 1–14. <https://doi.org/10.1088/1751-8113/44/8/085201>

Volf, P. (2020). Translation techniques as a method for describing the results and classifying the types of translation solutions. *Applied Translation*. <https://doi.org/10.51708/apptrans.v14n2.1171>

Yang, W. (2010). Brief Study on Domestication and Foreignization in Translation. *Journal of Language Teaching and Research*, 1(1), 77–80. <https://doi.org/10.4304/jltr.1.1.77-80>

